

```
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
1
2
              SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
    GEN-PROBE INCORPORATED,
3
4
                    Plaintiff,
                                  )No. 99cv2668 H (AJB)
5
               vs.
    VYSIS, INC.,
6
                    Defendant.
7
8
9
                The confidential deposition of DONALD
    NEIL HALBERT, Ph.D., called as a witness for
10
11
    examination, taken pursuant to the Federal Rules of
    Civil Procedure of the United States District
12
13
    Courts pertaining to the taking of depositions,
14
    taken before ANDREA L. CARTER, a Notary Public
    within and for the County of Cook, State of
15
16
    Illinois, and a Certified Shorthand Reporter of
17
    said state, CSR No. 84-3722, at 100 Abbott Park
18
    Road, Abbott, Illinois, on the 19th day of April,
19
    A.D. 2001, at 10:17 a.m.
20
21
22
23
24
```

ESQUIRE DEPOSITION SERVICES

- definition of amplify that we looked at in column 2 of the '338 patent?
  - A. I don't recall.

- Q. Are you aware of anyone else at either Gene-Trak or Amoco that during -- again bracketing those two dates that did any work that you would believe fell within the definition of amplify?
  - A. I really don't recall.
- Q. During the discussions that took place between you -- some combination of you,
  Dr. Lawrie, Dr. King, Dr. Collins that we have talked about earlier, were there proposals advanced for methods to amplify nucleic acids that had been captured using a capture probe?
  - A. I believe that's correct.
- Q. What proposals were advanced?
  - A. I can recall nonspecific methods of amplification as defined by random hexamer probe amplification and other types of enzyme -- enzymatic amplification. Frankly, I am not sure whether my recollection is accurate going back to that date—or whether it's based on-me going back and reviewing some of the documents that I have seen in the meantime.

Including the invention disclosure? 1 Q. 2 Α. Correct. Is it true that there was a general 3 0. desire -- again, I will use these same dates of 4 5 bracketing November 1985 and 1986 unless I indicate otherwise. But during this time frame, that there 6 was a desire to identify amplification techniques 7 that could be used to amplify a nucleic acid that 8 9 did not involve PCR? 10 Α. Yes. 11 And is it true that the reason why there Q. 12 was a desire to find something other than PCR is at 13 least in part that there were questions scientific, technical questions as to whether or 14 15 not PCR at that time could be adequately quantitated for use in a diagnostic assay? 16 17 Α. I seem to recall those types of 18 discussions, yes. 19 And was there -- wasn't there also a 0. 20 concern within the Amtrack -- Amtrack. have been a great name if they combined the 21 companies between the Amoco and Gene-Trak. 22 23 MR. BANKS: I think that was taken. 24 BY MR. SWINTON: Ex. 9 Pg. 35

```
1
           0.
                 Between the Amoco and Gene-Trak teams,
     wasn't there also a concern that helped to motivate
  2
  3
      in part this desire to find something other than
     PCR that there were concerns about whether or not
  4
  5
     PCR was going to be available for other
  6
     participants in the industry to use other than the
     then presumed owner of Cetus?
  7
  8
          Α.
                 Yes.
  9
          MR. VESSELINOVITCH: Objection to the --
 10
     BY MR. SWINTON:
                Where there any other concerns expressed
 11
          Q.
 12
     among this assembled group during this time period
     that motivated a desire to find an amplification
 13
 14
     method other than PCR?
 15
          Α.
                Could you repeat that question?
 16
          Q.
                Sure. Were there any other concerns
 17
     expressed among this assembled group during this
     time frame that formed at least in part a
 18
 19
     motivation to find an amplification method other
 20
     than PCR?
 21
          MR. BANKS: Object to form.
--22
     BY-THE WITNESS:
 23
          Α.
                Not that I recall.
 24
     BY MR. SWINTON:
                      Ex. 9 Pg. 36
```